

[Parties and Counsel Listed on Signature Pages]

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

IN RE: SOCIAL MEDIA ADOLESCENT
ADDICTION/PERSONAL INJURY PRODUCTS
LIABILITY LITIGATION

THIS FILING RELATES TO:

ALL ACTIONS

MDL No. 3047

Civil Case No. 4:22-md-03047-YGR (PHK)

Honorable Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers

Magistrate Judge: Hon. Peter H. Kang

**STIPULATION AND ~~PROPOSED~~
ORDER **AS MODIFIED** REGARDING
FORMAT OF DISCOVERY
MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE
STATEMENTS**

STIPULATION

The Personal Injury (“PI”), School District and Local Government Entity (“SD”), and Attorney General (“AG”) Plaintiffs and Defendants hereby stipulate as follows:

1. In Discovery Management Order (“DMO”) 1 (ECF 503), the Court requested a Joint Status Report ahead of the first Discovery Management Conference (“DMC”), advising the Court as to: (1) the status of discovery; (2) the Parties’ progress in meeting discovery deadlines; (3) discovery disputes which are ripe for this Court’s resolution; (4) discovery issues which the Parties are still meeting and conferring on and which presently do not require Court action; and (5) any other issues or obstacles to discovery the Parties have encountered which would risk impacting the overall discovery schedule, including any issues related to discovery in Coordinated or Related Actions which risk impacting the orderly progress of discovery in this action.

2. In DMO 2 (ECF 606), the Court further ordered the Parties to “include reporting to the Court on the progress of document productions and whether the Parties appear on track to meet [the] substantial completion deadline.” In Case Management Order 7 (ECF 1159), the Court set a November 5, 2024, deadline for the substantial completion of document productions in response to Plaintiffs’ Requests for Production of Documents (“RFPs”).

3. The Parties have been submitting DMC Statements in accordance with the Court’s prior Orders to date, including detailed updates under headings styled (I) Status of Discovery and Parties’ Progress in Meeting Discovery Deadlines; (II) Ripe Discovery Disputes; and (III) Discovery Issues that Do Not Currently Require Court Action. Under this format, the most recent (October) DMC Statement reached 68 pages in length (not including the Appendix).

4. As the Parties move into the deposition phase of these proceedings, the Parties have agreed, with the Court’s permission, that it would be beneficial to all Parties and the Court, and would preserve judicial and Party resources, to streamline DMC Statements going forward.

5. To that end, the Parties have agreed, pending the Court’s consent, to submit all briefing on ripe disputes in accordance with the joint letter-brief process set forth in Section H of the Court’s Standing Order for Civil (eff. June 1, 2023), and to no longer submit any briefing on ripe disputes in the DMC

Statement itself. The Parties have been working cooperatively and, they submit, effectively to present ripe disputes to Your Honor through the joint letter-brief process, and would continue to do so for future ripe disputes.

6. The Parties have further agreed, pending the Court's consent, to focus the DMC Statements going forward such that they consist of an agenda that would present, in no more than one bullet per item: (I) a list of any jointly agreed administrative items for discussion at the next DMC, such as stipulated requests to extend particular deadlines; and (II) a list of discovery disputes that will be ripe for hearing at the next DMC **or at any hearing set by this Court**, with citations to the docket entries corresponding to the joint letter-brief that presents each dispute. The Parties have agreed, pending the Court's consent, to no longer include summaries of all unripe disputes in the DMC Statement or elsewhere, **but shall include a bullet point list of unripe disputes.**

7. The Parties submit that this approach is consistent with recent guidance from Judge Gonzalez Rogers at the October 25, 2024 Case Management Conference ("CMC"), where she ordered the Parties to "abbreviate future case management statements"¹ based on feedback she recently received at an annual MDL conference:

I understand from your MDL colleagues that, in general, the process [of drafting joint statements] is a disaster. That everybody wants to say their peace [sic], that people want to relitigate, that it takes hours and hours and hours to do. ... All I'm really looking for is an agenda, the basic outline of what it is you need to discuss, so that I can discuss it with you, not so that I can read it. ... I don't want argument, I don't want statements, I just want the list so that I can figure out what's the most important thing to talk about. ... That's the point of the statements, to give me the list of basic issues.

10/25/24 CMC Tr. at 8:20-10:22.

8. Thus, in CMO 18, Judge Gonzalez Rogers ordered each CMC Statement going forward be organized as follows:

- Page 1: Agenda for the day.
- Page 2: Update on JCCP and discovery proceedings.

¹ Case Management Order ("CMO") 18 (ECF 1290) at 1.

• The parties may have no more than 10 additional pages (5 each side) to address issues and raise topics to be considered during the conference. The Court emphasizes that substantive argument is often unnecessary, and a brief statement of position (i.e., a few sentences) is typically sufficient as to a given issue.

9. In light of the above, the Parties jointly request entry of below ~~Proposed~~ Order, so-ordering their agreed streamlined approach to DMC Statements going forward.

~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER

10. In accordance with the Parties' stipulated agreement, the Court hereby ORDERS the Parties going forward to present all ripe discovery disputes in accordance with the joint letter-brief process set forth in Section H of the Court's Standing Order for Civil (eff. June 1, 2023).

11. The Court further ORDERS the Parties going forward to limit their DMC Statements submitted 7 days in advance of DMCs to (a) an agenda that would present, in no more than one bullet per item: (I) a list of any jointly agreed administrative items for discussion at the next DMC, such as stipulated requests to extend particular deadlines; and (II) a list of discovery disputes that will be ripe for hearing at the next DMC **or at any hearing set by this Court**, with citations to the docket entries corresponding to the joint letter-brief that presents each dispute; and (b) concise reports on items specifically requested by the Court in DMOs.

12. The Court further ORDERS that the Parties' DMC Statements shall ~~no longer~~ **only** include a list ~~or summary~~ of unripe disputes.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: November 13, 2024


MAGISTRATE JUDGE PETER H. KANG

1 Respectfully submitted,

2 DATED: November 13, 2024

By: /s/ Lexi J. Hazam

LEXI J. HAZAM

**LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &
BERNSTEIN, LLP**

275 BATTERY STREET, 29TH FLOOR
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94111-3339

Telephone: 415-956-1000

lhazam@lchb.com

PREVIN WARREN

MOTLEY RICE LLC

401 9th Street NW Suite 630

Washington DC 20004

Telephone: 202-386-9610

pwarren@motleyrice.com

Co-Lead Counsel

CHRISTOPHER A. SEEGER

SEEGER WEISS, LLP

55 CHALLENGER ROAD, 6TH FLOOR
RIDGEFIELD PARK, NJ 07660

Telephone: 973-639-9100

cseeger@seegerweiss.com

Counsel to Co-Lead Counsel

JENNIE LEE ANDERSON

ANDRUS ANDERSON, LLP

155 MONTGOMERY STREET, SUITE 900

SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94104

Telephone: 415-986-1400

jennie@andrusanderson.com

Liaison Counsel

EMILY C. JEFFCOTT

MORGAN & MORGAN

633 WEST FIFTH STREET, SUITE 2652

LOS ANGELES, CA 90071

Telephone: 213-787-8590

ejeffcott@forthepeople.com

JOSEPH VANZANDT

1 **BEASLEY ALLEN**
2 234 COMMERCE STREET
3 MONTGOMERY, LA 36103
4 Telephone: 334-269-2343
5 joseph.vanzandt@beasleyallen.com

Federal/State Liaisons

6 **MATTHEW BERGMAN**
7 **GLENN DRAPER**
8 **SOCIAL MEDIA VICTIMS LAW CENTER**
9 821 SECOND AVENUE, SUITE 2100
10 SEATTLE, WA 98104
11 Telephone: 206-741-4862
12 matt@socialmediavictims.org
13 glenn@socialmediavictims.org

14 **JAMES J. BILSBORROW**
15 **WEITZ & LUXENBERG, PC**
16 700 BROADWAY
17 NEW YORK, NY 10003
18 Telephone: 212-558-5500
19 jbilborrow@weitzlux.com

20 **JAYNE CONROY**
21 **SIMMONS HANLY CONROY, LLC**
22 112 MADISON AVE, 7TH FLOOR
23 NEW YORK, NY 10016
24 Telephone: 917-882-5522
25 jconroy@simmonsfirm.com

26 **ANDRE MURA**
27 **GIBBS LAW GROUP, LLP**
28 1111 BROADWAY, SUITE 2100
OAKLAND, CA 94607
Telephone: 510-350-9717
amm@classlawgroup.com

ALEXANDRA WALSH
WALSH LAW
1050 Connecticut Ave, NW, Suite 500
Washington D.C. 20036
Telephone: 202-780-3014
awalsh@alexwalshlaw.com

MICHAEL M. WEINKOWITZ
LEVIN SEDRAN & BERMAN, LLP
510 WALNUT STREET
SUITE 500
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19106
Telephone: 215-592-1500
mweinkowitz@lfsbalw.com

Plaintiffs' Steering Committee Leadership

RON AUSTIN
RON AUSTIN LAW
400 MANHATTAN BLVD.
HARVEY, LA 70058
Telephone: 504-227-8100
raustin@ronaustinlaw.com

PAIGE BOLDT
WALSH LAW
4 Dominion Drive, Bldg. 3, Suite 100
San Antonio, TX 78257
Telephone: 210-448-0500
PBoldt@alexwalshlaw.com

THOMAS P. CARTMELL
WAGSTAFF & CARTMELL LLP
4740 Grand Avenue, Suite 300
Kansas City, MO 64112
Telephone: 816-701-1100
tcartmell@wcllp.com

SARAH EMERY
HENDY JOHNSON VAUGHN EMERY PSC
600 WEST MAIN STREET, SUITE 100
LOUISVILLE, KY 40202
Telephone: 859-600-6725
semery@justicestartshere.com

CARRIE GOLDBERG
C.A. GOLDBERG, PLLC
16 Court St.
Brooklyn, NY 11241
Telephone: 646-666-8908
carrie@cagoldberglaw.com

RONALD E. JOHNSON, JR.

HENDY JOHNSON VAUGHN EMERY PSC
600 WEST MAIN STREET, SUITE 100
LOUISVILLE, KT 40202
Telephone: 859-578-4444
rjohnson@justicestartshere.com

SIN-TING MARY LIU
**AYLSTOCK WITKIN KREIS &
OVERHOLTZ, PLLC**
17 EAST MAIN STREET, SUITE 200
PENSACOLA, FL 32502
Telephone: 510-698-9566
mliu@awkolaw.com

JAMES MARSH
MARSH LAW FIRM PLLC
31 HUDSON YARDS, 11TH FLOOR
NEW YORK, NY 10001-2170
Telephone: 212-372-3030
jamesmarsh@marshlaw.com

JOSEPH E. MELTER
KESSLER TOPAZ MELTZER & CHECK LLP
280 KING OF PRUSSIA ROAD
RADNOR, PA 19087
Telephone: 610-667-7706
jmeltzer@ktmc.com

HILLARY NAPPI
HACH & ROSE LLP
112 Madison Avenue, 10th Floor
New York, New York 10016
Telephone: 212-213-8311
hnappi@hrsclaw.com

EMMIE PAULOS
LEVIN PAPANTONIO RAFFERTY
316 SOUTH BAYLEN STREET, SUITE 600
PENSACOLA, FL 32502
Telephone: 850-435-7107
epaulos@levinlaw.com

RUTH THI RIZKALLA
THE CARLSON LAW FIRM, PC
1500 ROSECRANS AVE., STE. 500
MANHATTAN BEACH, CA 90266

Telephone: 415-308-1915
rrizkalla@carlsonattorneys.com

ROLAND TELLIS
DAVID FERNANDES
BARON & BUDD, P.C.
15910 Ventura Boulevard, Suite 1600
Encino, CA 91436
Telephone: 818-839-2333
rtellis@baronbudd.com
dfernandes@baronbudd.com

MELISSA YEATES
KESSLER TOPAZ MELTZER & CHECK LLP
280 KING OF PRUSSIA ROAD
RADNOR, PA 19087
Telephone: 610-667-7706
myeates@ktmc.com

DIANDRA "FU" DEBROSSE ZIMMERMANN
DICELLO LEVITT
505 20th St North
Suite 1500
Birmingham, Alabama 35203
Telephone: 205-855-5700
fu@dicellolevitt.com

Plaintiffs' Steering Committee Membership

Attorneys for Individual Plaintiffs

PHILIP J. WEISER

Attorney General
State of Colorado

By: /s/ Bianca E. Miyata

Bianca E. Miyata, CO Reg. No. 42012,
pro hac vice
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Lauren M. Dickey, CO Reg. No. 45773, *pro hac vice*
First Assistant Attorney General
Megan Paris Rundlet, CO Reg. No. 27474
Senior Assistant Solicitor General
Elizabeth Orem, CO Reg. No. 58309
Assistant Attorney General
Colorado Department of Law
Ralph L. Carr Judicial Center
Consumer Protection Section
1300 Broadway, 7th Floor
Denver, CO 80203
Phone: (720) 508-6651
bianca.miyata@coag.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Colorado, ex rel.
Philip J. Weiser, Attorney General*

ROB BONTA

Attorney General
State of California

By: /s/ Megan O'Neill

Nicklas A. Akers (CA SBN 211222)
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Bernard Eskandari (SBN 244395)
Emily Kalanithi (SBN 256972)
Supervising Deputy Attorneys General
Nayha Arora (CA SBN 350467)
Megan O'Neill (CA SBN 343535)
Joshua Olszewski-Jubelirer (CA SBN 336428)
Marissa Roy (CA SBN 318773)
Brendan Ruddy (CA SBN 297896)
Deputy Attorneys General
California Department of Justice
Office of the Attorney General
455 Golden Gate Ave., Suite 11000
San Francisco, CA 94102-7004
Phone: (415) 510-4400

Fax: (415) 703-5480
Megan.Oneill@doj.ca.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State of
California*

RUSSELL COLEMAN

Attorney General
Commonwealth of Kentucky

By: /s/ J. Christian Lewis

J. Christian Lewis (KY Bar No. 87109),

Pro hac vice

Philip Heleringer (KY Bar No. 96748),

Pro hac vice

Zachary Richards (KY Bar No. 99209),

Pro hac vice

Daniel I. Keiser (KY Bar No. 100264),

Pro hac vice

Matthew Cocanougher (KY Bar No. 94292),

Pro hac vice

Assistant Attorneys General

1024 Capital Center Drive, Suite 200

Frankfort, KY 40601

CHRISTIAN.LEWIS@KY.GOV

PHILIP.HELERINGER@KY.GOV

ZACH.RICHARDS@KY.GOV

DANIEL.KEISER@KY.GOV

MATTHEW.COCANOUGH@KY.GOV

Phone: (502) 696-5300

Fax: (502) 564-2698

Attorneys for Plaintiff the Commonwealth of Kentucky

MATTHEW J. PLATKIN

Attorney General
State of New Jersey

By: /s/ Thomas Huynh

Kashif T. Chand (NJ Bar No. 016752008),

Pro hac vice

Section Chief, Deputy Attorney General

Thomas Huynh (NJ Bar No. 200942017),

Pro hac vice

Assistant Section Chief, Deputy Attorney General

Verna J. Pradaxay (NJ Bar No. 335822021),
Pro hac vice
Mandy K. Wang (NJ Bar No. 373452021),
Pro hac vice
Deputy Attorneys General
New Jersey Office of the Attorney General,
Division of Law
124 Halsey Street, 5th Floor
Newark, NJ 07101
Tel: (973) 648-2052
Kashif.Chand@law.njoag.gov
Thomas.Huynh@law.njoag.gov
Verna.Pradaxay@law.njoag.gov
Mandy.Wang@law.njoag.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs New Jersey Attorney General
and the New Jersey Division of Consumer Affairs
Matthew J. Platkin, Attorney General for the State of
New Jersey, and Cari Fais, Acting Director of the New
Jersey Division of Consumer Affairs*

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

By: /s/ Ashley M. Simonsen

Ashley M. Simonsen, SBN 275203

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

1999 Avenue of the Stars

Los Angeles, CA 90067

Telephone: (424) 332-4800

Facsimile: + 1 (424) 332-4749

Email: asimonsen@cov.com

Phyllis A. Jones, *pro hac vice*

Paul W. Schmidt, *pro hac vice*

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP

One City Center

850 Tenth Street, NW

Washington, DC 20001-4956

Telephone: + 1 (202) 662-6000

Facsimile: + 1 (202) 662-6291

Email: pajones@cov.com

*Attorney for Defendants Meta Platforms, Inc.
f/k/a Facebook, Inc.; Facebook Holdings,
LLC; Facebook Operations, LLC; Facebook
Payments, Inc.; Facebook Technologies, LLC;
Instagram, LLC; Siculus, Inc.; and Mark Elliot
Zuckerberg*

KING & SPALDING LLP

By: /s/ Geoffrey M. Drake

Geoffrey M. Drake, *pro hac vice*

TaCara D. Harris, *pro hac vice*

1180 Peachtree Street, NE, Suite 1600

Atlanta, GA 30309-3521

Telephone: (404) 572-4600

Facsimile: (404) 572-5100

Email: gdrake@kslaw.com

tharris@kslaw.com

Kristen R. Fournier, *pro hac vice*

KING & SPALDING LLP

1185 Avenue of the Americas, 34th Floor

New York, NY 10036-2601

Telephone: (212) 556-2100

Facsimile: (212) 556-2222

Email: kfournier@kslaw.com
David P. Mattern, *pro hac vice*
KING & SPALDING LLP
1700 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Suite 900
Washington, DC 20006-4707
Telephone: (202) 737-0500
Facsimile: (202) 626-3737
Email: dmattern@kslaw.com

Bailey J. Langner (SBN 307753)
KING & SPALDING LLP
50 California Street, Suite 3300
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: (415) 318-1200
Facsimile: (415) 318-1300
Email: blangner@kslaw.com

Andrea Roberts Pierson, *pro hac vice*
FAEGRE DRINKER LLP
300 N. Meridian Street, Suite 2500
Indianapolis, IN 46204
Telephone: + 1 (317) 237-0300
Facsimile: + 1 (317) 237-1000
Email: andrea.pierson@faegredrinker.com

Amy R. Fiterman, *pro hac vice*
FAEGRE DRINKER LLP
2200 Wells Fargo Center
90 South Seventh Street
Minneapolis, MN 55402
Telephone: +1 (612) 766-7768
Facsimile: +1 (612) 766-1600
Email: amy.fiterman@faegredrinker.com

*Attorneys for Defendants TikTok Inc., ByteDance Inc.,
TikTok Ltd., ByteDance Ltd., and TikTok LLC*

MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP
By: /s/ Jonathan H. Blavin
Jonathan H. Blavin, SBN 230269
MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP
560 Mission Street, 27th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94105-3089
Telephone: (415) 512-4000
Facsimile: (415) 512-4077

Email: jonathan.blavin@mto.com

Rose L. Ehler (SBN 29652)
Victoria A. Degtyareva (SBN 284199)
Laura M. Lopez, (SBN 313450)
Ariel T. Teshuva (SBN 324238)
MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP
350 South Grand Avenue, 50th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071-3426
Telephone: (213) 683-9100
Facsimile: (213) 687-3702
Email: rose.ehler@mto.com
Email: victoria.degtyareva@mto.com
Email: Ariel.Teshuva@mto.com

Lauren A. Bell (*pro hac vice forthcoming*)
MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP
601 Massachusetts Ave., NW St.,
Suite 500 E
Washington, D.C. 20001-5369
Telephone: (202) 220-1100
Facsimile: (202) 220-2300
Email: lauren.bell@mto.com

Attorneys for Defendant Snap Inc.

WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI
Professional Corporation
By: /s/ Brian M. Willen
Brian M. Willen (*pro hac vice*)
WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI
1301 Avenue of the Americas, 40th Floor
New York, New York 10019
Telephone: (212) 999-5800
Facsimile: (212) 999-5899
Email: bwillen@wsgr.com

Lauren Gallo White (SBN 309075)
Samantha A. Machock (SBN 298852)
WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI
One Market Plaza, Spear Tower, Suite 3300
San Francisco, CA 94105
Telephone: (415) 947-2000
Facsimile: (415) 947-2099
Email: lwhite@wsgr.com
Email: smachock@wsgr.com

Christopher Chiou (SBN 233587)
Matthew K. Donohue (SBN 302144)
WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI
953 East Third Street, Suite 100
Los Angeles, CA 90013
Telephone: (323) 210-2900
Facsimile: (866) 974-7329
Email: cchiou@wsgr.com
Email: mdonohue@wsgr.com

Attorneys for Defendants YouTube, LLC and Google LLC

WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP
By: /s/ Joseph G. Petrosinelli
Joseph G. Petrosinelli (*pro hac vice*)
jpetrosinelli@wc.com
Ashley W. Hardin (*pro hac vice*)
ahardin@wc.com
680 Maine Avenue, SW
Washington, DC 20024
Telephone.: 202-434-5000
Fax: 202-434-5029

Attorneys for Defendants YouTube, LLC and Google LLC

MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP
By: /s/ Yardena R. Zwang-Weissman
Yardena R. Zwang-Weissman (SBN 247111)
300 South Grand Avenue, 22nd Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071-3132
Tel.: 213.612.7238
Email: yardena.zwang-weissman@morganlewis.com

Brian Ercole (*pro hac vice*)
600 Brickell Avenue, Suite 1600
Miami, FL 33131-3075
Tel.: 305.415.3416
Email: brian.ercole@morganlewis.com

Stephanie Schuster (*pro hac vice*)
1111 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
NW Washington, DC 20004-2541
Tel.: 202.373.6595

Email: stephanie.schuster@morganlewis.com

*Attorneys for Defendants YouTube, LLC and Google
LLC*

ATTESTATION

I, Ashley M. Simonsen, hereby attest, pursuant to N.D. Cal. Civil L.R. 5-1, that the concurrence to the filing of this document has been obtained from each signatory hereto.

Dated: November 13, 2024

By: /s/ Ashley M. Simonsen